

Short listing of EOLs for the "Conduct Third Party Validation of Project Results (Performance Audit)" under TA Component of Sindh Public Sector Management Reform Project IDA Credit No: 5584-PK

Sr. No	Name of Firm/ Associations / JV	Address	Qualification & Accreditation of the firm (10 Marks)	Evaluation Criteria			Awarded Scores					Final Evaluation Score (Out of 100)	Ranking	Recommendation
				Work Experience of the firm (30 Marks)	Overall Managerial Capacity of the firm (30 Marks)	Proposed Work Plan, Methodology and Timelines (30 Marks)	Chairman CSC/ Director, ERL, FD (Marks in Hand- 25)	Member CSC/ Representative of P&ID (Marks in Hand- 25)	Member CSC/ Representative of SC&CAD (Marks in Hand- 25)	Secretary CSC/ Representative of ERL, FD (Marks in Hand- 25)				
1	EY Field Rhodes Chartered Accountants	EY Field Rhodes Chartered Accountants, 6th Floor, Progressive Plaza, Beaman Road, P.O. Box 13541, Karachi, 75330, Pakistan Tel : +9221 33659007-11 Fax : +9221 33681965 Email: eyn@pk.ey.com Web: www.ey.com	Registered as MSB Firm & Young Field Rhodes Sindh Jhokar & Co.  Labeled as a SHP Category 'A' Auditor-A5  A valid OCR rating and Certificate of Assessment of ACK Checklist and Quality Control Review from ICAP  Registered with HRB with Valid NTN No. 142191-1. Registered with Sindh Revenue Board with SST Registration No. 1452191-1.	EY Field Rhodes has ample experience of working on similar assignments for government setups at local and international level. The firm has been conducting TPV of various projects for leading development organizations like IFU, UNICEF, British Council, JPHD, UNFPA, USAID and has directly conducted TPV of World Bank funded projects. The major TPV assignments include HSR, PPKM (Punjab Public Management Reform Program), PERSU, PSMF, BSSITP (Training Program under SSDF- Supply & Delivery of F&T/Acc. It has also been awarded TPV of various projects of Italy in Pakistan and has undertaken similar projects in Ghana, Afghanistan, India, etc. through its Pakistan office.  The firm has conducted different audit activities for the GAs on other WB funded projects like SAGP. It has also carried out independent procurement review for various projects.	The firm shall provide a seasoned team, dedicated to meeting the scope of services for the skills and experience relevant to the assignment.  The firm has proposed a well-rounded team, with UNFPA, USAID and has directly conducted TPV of World Bank funded projects. The major TPV assignments include HSR, PPKM (Punjab Public Management Reform Program), PERSU, PSMF, BSSITP (Training Program under SSDF- Supply & Delivery of F&T/Acc. It has also been awarded TPV of various projects of Italy in Pakistan and has undertaken similar projects in Ghana, Afghanistan, India, etc. through its Pakistan office.  The firm has conducted different audit activities for the GAs on other WB funded projects like SAGP. It has also carried out independent procurement review for various projects.	EY has shown good understanding of the scope of work and has proposed a good methodology to carry out the performance audit. The firm has indicated the understanding of needs of the government and its role in ensuring the deliverables.  EY has read the ToRs and the respective PAD document and has shown good grasp of the DLI's with a proposal to validate them accordingly.  The firm has also understood the need to conduct the audit in a timely manner for the success of the project and subsequently, in the upcoming years till the end of project.  The firm has proposed its approach to be based on a Service Delivery Approach (SDA) for carrying out this specific assignment, with phase-wise execution of all tasks.	23.5	23	23	23.5	93	1	Top-Ranked	
2	Deloitte Young' Aali Chartered Accountants	Deloitte Young' Aali Chartered Accountants, 7&8, KCHSU, Shikhar-e-Faisal, Karachi.  Phone: + 93 (0) 21345640457 Fax: +92 (0) 21 4541314 Email: aashah@deloitte.com	Registered as MSB Deloitte Young' Aali Chartered Accountants. Listed as a SHP Category 'A' Auditor- A4  A valid OCR rating and Certificate of Assessment of ACK Checklist and Quality Control Review from ICAP. Registered with HRB with Valid NTN No. 2146464-4.  Registered with Sindh Revenue Board with SST Registration No. 2146464-4.	Deloitte is present in Pakistan since 1972, and has a strength of 850 people across its 4 offices in the country and also caters to operations in Afghanistan through an office in Kabul.  The firm has been conducting TPV of various projects for national and international agencies. The major TPV assignments include PSMF (Punjab Rural Support Program), TEVTA, SSB under SERP, II (WB), etc.  The firm has been conducting audit of various donor funded projects for development organizations like UNICEF, USAID, World Bank, etc. The firm has also conducted TPV of various projects of Govt. (Competition Program), Council of Assistance for School Specific Budgets (SSB), Govt. Assessment of FIM and Procurement systems for KPK, etc.  The firm also has indicated its experience of conducting independent verification and validation through its international partner in different countries including the US.  However, no evidence has been provided of conducting TPV of DLI based projects.	The firm provides a seasoned team, dedicated to meeting the needs of government with the skills and experience relevant to the assignment.  However, the team lacks direct experience of conducting TPV activity (Performance audit), as indicated in the document (5a)  The team has limited exposure of conducting TPV for donor funded projects.	Deloitte has shown good understanding of the scope of work of the government and has proposed a good methodology to carry out the assignment. It has indicated its methodology to be based around PPKs which shall entail the DLI in preceding terms. However, their may be a problem as the DLI is and their targets need to be understood independently to set a base for the validation of their results. There's no mention of methodology for the verification of DLI results as its only PPKs that have been defined. The firm has proposed its approach to be based on a Service Delivery Approach (SDA) for carrying out this specific assignment in a timely manner to carry the assignment in a timely manner.	18	18	17	16	69	2	Second-Ranked	

Note: The Committee members have allowed ERL, FD to negotiate with the top-ranked firm and proceed for the signing of contract, based on the evaluation.

(IAMSHEED AHMED)  
Secretary  
Representative of DS, IR&A, SG&AC Department,  
Government of Sindh/Member

(RAYAN TALAL ZAHID)  
Procurement & Contract Management Specialist,  
Economic Reform Unit, Finance Department, Government of Sindh/  
Secretary.

(SAYED AHMED)  
Director, Economic Reform Unit/ Project Director, Sindh Public Sector Management Reform Project, Finance Department, Government of Sindh/ Chairman

(NAVEED MANSOOR)  
Director (MIS), Monitoring & Evaluation Cell, Planning & Development Department, Government of Sindh / Member

